

Minutes of Special Meeting of SNM Management Committee and Trophy Donors
Nelson
15 January 2017, 9 am

Present: Jos and Margaret Pattison, Mandy Bishop, Stephen Fryer, Hamish Neill, Kareen Howes, Jim Sinner, Susie Foster, Hamish Neill

1. Welcome

Stephen Fryer welcomed everyone and thanked them for attending at such short notice. The aim of the meeting is to discuss the trophy criteria openly and get a resolution. Stephen asked Jim to lead the rest of the meeting.

2. Apologies

Management Committee apologies: Lorraine McMath, Mandy Thomas, Melinda Baigent, Steve Fox, Steve Malthus

Jim noted that Lorraine, Steve Malthus and Steve Fox have no strong views on the criteria and are happy to support majority view, whereas Mandy T and Melinda want to stick with original decisions.

Apologies from donors: Jenni Gane, Cherie Trevurza, Kirsty Rukuwai

Jim has spoken to all of these donors and will introduce their comments as items are discussed.

3. Overview of meeting

- Present current proposal
- Comments from donors
- Discuss proposed criteria for each age group.
- Summarise areas of agreement and disagreement
- SNM Management Committee decisions

Jim confirmed that was OK with everyone.

4. Current proposal

Rationale

- Encourage swimmers to swim all strokes and align incentives with criteria for National events
- Reward quality swimming over quantity swimming
- Encourage older swimmers to swim longer events, as in the Xlr8 programme
- Overall, help them achieve their potential and reach nationals if possible.

Elements

1. Eligibility requirements
 - 9 & U – 3 strokes
 - 10, 11, 12 – 3 strokes plus IM
 - 13 and over – 4 strokes plus IM plus long distance (800 for girls, 1500 for boys)

2. All swimmers, except 10 year olds, earn points for all swims
3. Cap individual entries to 10
4. Maintain current meet points

5. Comments from donors

Jenni & Sara Gane (9 and unders)

- agree with 3 stroke requirements
- Count points for 50s, 100s, 200s (except fly)
- Do not count points for longer swims
- Noted that we have added the 200 breast and back, so could create a 10 and U age groups for the 200s.

Jim suggested that we have timed finals for 200s for the 10 and under age group. Juniors has timed finals. Want to keep the younger swimmers interested (avoid discouraging)

Melinda Baigent (11 year olds)

- Maintain proposal as agreed last meeting

Cherie Trevurza (13 year olds)

- Ok with 4 strokes plus IM
- Not happy with requirement for long distance events

Kirsty and Nigel Rukuwai (15 and over)

- 'Best overall' is not the same things as 'best all-round'
- Want trophy to be accessible to all swimmers in the region
- Don't agree with all 4 strokes requirement but can live with
- Opposed to long distance requirements – this can act as a disadvantage to swimmers trying to get national times since they must first do a long distance event.

Jos and Margaret Pattison (14 year olds)

- Ok with 4 strokes plus IM
- Smaller clubs that swim only in the summer do not get the opportunity to get fit enough for the long distance requirements or the 400 IM, therefore the 800/1500 should not be a requirement.
- Coaching situations change. Should not make it impossible for people to win a trophy.
- Not in favour of SNZ's focus on the IM. If swimmers are good at a particular stroke they should focus on this.
- The idea is that the best swimmer should win the cup.

Kareen Howes, on behalf of Margaret Young (10 year olds)

- OK with 3 strokes
- Count points for 50s, 100s, 200s (except fly) only
- Do not count points for longer swims (but can choose to enter these for club points)
- Swimmers are keen to qualify for national events
- It should be about free choice, with advice from coaches

Susie commented:

- SNZ is encouraging Juniors and Div 2 to do all strokes: therefore gatekeeper is IM
- For national development squads the gatekeeper is FINA points (not multiple strokes)
- Don't want to eliminate the country clubs from being able to win the trophies.

6. Discussion

1. Cap : Is 10 the right number?

Noted there are 5 sessions and with prelims and finals swimmers could swim up to 18 events.

Agreed that 10 is a good balance.

2. 9 and U, and 10 years olds

- a. Strokes
 - i. 3 strokes (9 & U) – Jenni agrees
 - ii. 3 strokes plus 200 IM – Karen wants this to be open within the set of 50s, 100s, all 200s except 200 fly (12 events). Considering whether it would be OK to remove 200 IM and retain 3 strokes.
- b. Donors wish to see scoring for the basic 12 events, and no points toward the trophy for longer distance (but swimmers may enter these events).
 - i. Some MC members preferred to allow scoring for longer distance events.
 - ii. Swimmers targeting the trophies will enter 10 events therefore will be swimming 3 strokes.
 - iii. However, having the 3 strokes requirement sends a 'message' that we expect swimmers to swim a variety of strokes.
- c. Agreed to timed finals for 200m events for 9&U and 10 year olds.

3. 11 and 12 year olds

- a. Strokes—3 strokes plus IM
- b. All events to count toward trophy (including 800 for girls, 1500 for boys)

Agreed.

4. 13, 14, and 15 and Over

- a. Strokes
 - i. Requirement for 4 strokes plus IM – accepted by Pattisons, Trevurzas and Rukuwais
 - ii. All donors wish to exclude requirement long distance events (800 and 1500)
 - iii. Pattisons happy to include a 400, which could be the 400 IM and count against both eligibility criteria
- b. Straw poll: Should we drop the 800/1500 as a requirement? Majority agreed
- c. Straw poll: Should we add in requirement to do a 'longer distance' where 400 free or 400 IM can also satisfy this, and 400 IM can count for both the IM and the longer distance event? 5 in support, 2 opposed (plus Kirsty, by phone)

7. Management Committee decisions – revised proposal

Moved that we change the criteria as agreed on 10 Jan to the following:

9 and U and 10 year olds

- Eligibility requirement: 3 strokes, one of which can be IM
- Only points for 50s, 100s, and 200s (except 200 fly) count toward trophies
- Points for longer distance events count toward club points.
- Timed finals for 200m events for each age group

11 and 12 year olds (unchanged)

- Eligibility requirement: 3 strokes plus IM
- All events count toward trophies

13, 14 and 15 over

- 4 strokes plus IM
- All events count toward trophies

Cap individual entries at 10 (unchanged)

Use current meet points for scoring (unchanged)

Noting that, in the interest of reaching agreement, the eligibility requirement for a longer distance event for the 13 and over age group trophies be left out for this year.

Jim/ Susie/carried

(with support, by phone, from Steve Malthus, Lorraine McMath, Melinda Baigent, Steve Fox

Against: Mandy T, & Mandy B

(The motion was held open so that all the votes could be recorded.)

Melinda and Steve Fox noted that they would have preferred to keep the requirement for longer distance events but, in the interest of moving on, voted to support the motion.

8. Concluding discussion

After the LC Champs we should have a debrief:

- Did the best 'overall' swimmers win the trophies?
- Check the LC Champs results with FINA points.

Jos noted that this has been a good venue & time to do this discussion (rather than at Committee meetings).

Stephen thanked everyone for moving the discussion forward.

Meeting closed at 11.05 am.